

Family Tree of the Nemanjić Dynasty Fresco, 1350 Dečani, Serbi—Monastery Church

# Art and Architecture in the Balkans an annotated bibliography

SLOBODAN ĆURČIĆ



## Contents



The Author								0 12				٠	٠			٠	٠			xi
Preface																				xiii
Acknowledg	nents																			xix
Principal I	Bibli	og	ra	ph	ii	ca.	1 1	No:	rki	5.										xxi
Principal I	Perio	di	ca	15	3.															xxiii
Balkans																				1
General	1																			1
Archite																				2
Painti																				4
Minor																				6
Iconog																				6
Albania					:															9
General	1																			9
Archite																				14
Painti																				17
Minor	_																			19
Sites.																				19

C	01	ıt	ei	11	ts

Bu1	garia		٠	•	•																		٠		29
	General																								29
	Architecture			÷																					40
	Painting																								48
	General .																								48
	Frescoes.																						-		50
	Icons																								54
	Manuscrip																								57
	Sculpture																								61
	Minor Arts .																								63
	Minor Arts . Iconography.									1.5													Ĭ	Ī	71
	Builders, Ar	tis	sts	3.	P	atı	ro	ns									Ċ								74
	Sites																								75
																				•	·	,		·	
Yug	oslavia									٠				٠	٠										123
	General																								123
	Architecture																								135
	Painting																								156
	General .																								156
	Frescoes.																								164
	Icons																								170
	Manuscript																								180
	Sculpture																								189
	Minor Arts .																								203
	Iconography.																								
	Iconography. Builders, Art	tis	sts	3.	Pa	atı	con	ns			Ċ	Ċ			Ü						Ì	Ì			238
	Sites			,					·		Ĭ.		-				·					Ċ			248
	Sites		·	i	·		•	-	Ť	·	•	•			Ġ	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	·	•	2 10
Add	enda											٠									٠				383
	hor Index																								385
nuc	nor midex	•	•	•	i	•	•	•		•	•	•	•	÷	•		•	•	•	i	ů	•	•	•	303
Gen	eral Index																								397

### Preface

This volume on art and architecture in the Balkans differs from most other volumes in this series in that its focus, rather than being topical, chronological, or stylistic, is strictly geographical. The material included reveals such great diversity that it defies classification in accordance with established systems in art historical scholarship. Yet it is precisely this complexity that makes the Balkans an area of prime interest for study, particularly of East-West relations. Coexistance, juxtaposition, fusion, and rejection of various artistic modes and styles over the centuries mirror a turbulent pattern of political history in an area that to this day straddles the political and cultural divide between the East and the West.

The present volume constitutes the first comprehensive bibliographical compilation of literature on medieval art and architecture of the Balkan Peninsula as a whole; it is also the first on any part of the medieval Balkans to appear with annotations in English. As such, it is intended to introduce much important material to a wider audience than has been possible in the past. Although this bibliography was never envisioned as being exhaustive, its coverage is thorough, taking into account all of the visual arts in all their aspects.

Geographic and cultural scope. At the outset, it is necessary to define the use of the name <u>Balkans</u> in the title of this book. The geographic territory considered for our purposes is the area covered by the modern states of Albania, Bulgaria, and Yugoslavia (with its six federated republics: Serbia, Croatia, Slovenia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Macedonia, and Montenegro). The obvious major exclusions are the state of Greece and the European portion of Turkey, with the city of Istanbul (Constantinople). Because the medieval material in these areas is predominantly Byzantine, it will be included in later volumes on Byzantine art and architecture due to appear in this series. From some points of view Rumania may also be considered an exclusion. It should be noted, however, that Rumania is not, strictly speaking, a Balkan country in the geographic sense; and although strong cultural ties bound Wallachia and Moldavia (medieval states on the

territory of modern Rumania) and the Balkan states at times, equally strong ties linked them with other parts of eastern and central Europe. For these reasons it was decided to exclude Rumania from consideration here.

The diversity of medieval material concerning Albania, Bulgaria, and Yugoslavia is a result of complex religious and political circumstances during the Middle Ages. It should be kept in mind, however, that these circumstances were not specifically a product of the Middle Ages. Indeed, they were the legacy of late Antiquity, and they continue into our own times. A major East-West cultural divide has run through this area at least since the partition of the Roman Empire into two administrative halves by Emperor Diocletian. line of poltiical division coincided, in fact, with an older frontier separating the Greek-speaking from the Latin-speaking world. quest for ecclesiastical predominance that ensued in the early centuries of Christianity caused continuous conflicts over the question of jurisdiction between Roman popes and Constantinopolitan patriarchs, finally leading to the break between the Roman Catholic and Greek Orthodox churches in 1054. Thus in dealing with art and architecture in this area, the term medieval has, of necessity, extremely broad connotations. It applies at the same time to Byzantine, pre-Romanesque, Romanesque, and Gothic styles as well as all of the local variants, including the mixtures of two or more of these styles in the same work of art or in the same edifice.

Although modern political borders do not necessarily coincide with those of the medieval states, the selection and organization of the material has followed the modern alignments. This has induced a potential problem, which I have attempted to remedy in the following manner. Monuments located on the territory of a modern state but in reality belonging to the medieval cultural heritage of another nation are listed by their modern location, the problem being pointed out in the specific annotations (e.g., Spasovica—a church built by the Serbian King Stefan Dečanski—is found under Bulgaria; Sites; Spasovitsa, while Dolna Kamenitsa—a church built during the reign of the Bulgarian Emperor Michael Shishman—appears under Yugoslavia; Sites; Donja Kamenica).

Chronological scope. The chronological scope of the "Middle Ages" for the purposes of this work has been equally difficult to define. In general, the beginning of the Middle Ages should be understood to coincide with the invasion of the Byzantine Empire by Slavs during the late sixth and early seventh centuries. Early Byzantine material (sixth through eighth centuries), however, has not been considered. Archaeological finds relative to the early history of the Slavs in the Balkan Peninsula are considered only insofar as scarce art objects are considered. A greater concentration of material begins only with the religious and cultural conversion of the South Slavs in the ninth century. Thus for all practical purposes the ninth

### Preface

century may be assumed to be the general starting point of the Middle Ages in this context. A major exception has been made for early Byzantine material found in Albania, which has been included to give the highly limited information on medieval art and architecture in that country as broad a coverage as possible, even at the risk of duplication of some material in another volume in this series.

Middle and late Byzantine material found on the territories of Albania, Bulgaria, and Yugoslavia is also included, again with a full understanding that some of this material may also appear in other volumes of this series. The reason for such a decision is the difficulty of drawing a clear line of distinction between Byzantine and local patronage, Byzantine and local stylistic qualities, Byzantine and local artists, builders, etc. Thus, for example, the church of the Virgin Peribleptos (present St. Clement) in Ohrid, Yugoslavia, built in 1295, was painted by two Byzantine Greek painters, Michael and Eutichios, hired by a local patron named Progon Zgur. Clearly, such a monument could receive two classifications—either as a Byzantine or as a local monument. All such examples are included in this study.

The terminal point of the "Middle Ages" in the Balkans is also elusive. Historically, the fall of various Balkan states to the Turks in the course of the second half of the fifteenth century is generally considered to mark the end of the medieval era. Yet the artistic and architectural production sponsored by the Orthodox Church under the Turkish yoke reveals a different picture. This material bespeaks a highly conservative, almost fossilized survival of medieval styles of art and architecture well into sixteenth, seventeenth, and even eighteenth centuries. Characterized in scholarship as "Byzance apres Byzance," this material can only be meaningfully considered as "medieval," notwithstanding its late date. On the other hand, in the western parts of the Balkans, unaffected by Turkish conquest and under the influence of Italy, a more familiar transition between the Middle Ages and the Renaissance took place. One should note at this point that the term Renaissance is used with entirely different connotations in conjunction with Bulgarian art and architecture under the Turkish domination. Finally, Turkish art and architecture in the area under consideration, although contemporaneous with "Byzance apres Byzance," are excluded because they constitute a body of material belonging to another large cultural framework--that of Islam.

Manner of compilation. The task of compiling material for this study was at times frustrating. Although bibliographical works dealing with medieval art and architecture do exist in Bulgaria and Yugoslavia, they cover only the respective countries, employ different organizational principles, and are often not comprehensive. Among the more thorough modern bibliographical tools are such periodical bibliographies as the one appearing annually in Starinar (Belgrade).

Initiated only in 1958 its usefulness is limited to keeping abreast of current publications. In the category of bibliographical surveys, I consulted several in preparing the general guidelines for the organization of this work. The principal among these were: Jelisaveta S. Allen, ed., Liferature on Byzantine Art, 1892-1967, 2 vols. (Washington, D.C., 1973 and 1976); Sonfa Georgieva and Velizar Veklov, Bibliografiia na bŭlgarskata arkheologiia, 1879-1966 (Sofia, 1974); and Jelisaveta S. Allen, "A Bibliographic Survey of Publications on the Subject of History of Art and Archaeology in Yugoslavia, from Classical Antiquity to the Present Time" (unpublished M.S. Thesis, The Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C., 1968). On the basis of these bibliographical works I was able to establish a preliminary list of major books and relevant periodic literature. In evaluating the significance of periodic literature, I decided to conduct an exhaustive survey of a select number of Albanian, Bulgarian, and Yugoslav periodical runs. The final choice included forty-one periodicals whose titles appear listed in front of the text. In addition, a considerable number of periodicals of essentially local scope was also surveyed, some more comprehensively than others. With regard to periodic literature published outside Albania, Bulgaria, and Yugoslavia, I decided to conduct a systematic survey of only a limited number of particularly relevant periodicals such as Cahiers archeologiques (Paris), and Corsi di cultura sull'arte ravennate e bizantina (Ravenna). References have been made to numerous articles in many other periodicals, but not as a result of systematic surveys of these periodicals. In general, my aim was to concentrate on the literature published in the three countries under consideration. In conducting systematic surveys of periodical runs, I used 1979 as the concluding year of my investigation. Certain major works published after 1979 have been included, but this was done on an exceptional basis.

The following bibliographic criteria were employed in determining which material should not be included. If a major recent study on a subject is available, older literature judged to be redundant has been excluded. This was done only if the recent work is equipped with the proper documentary apparatus to ensure access to the older literature. Other exclusions involve works of art and architecture, or aspects thereof, whose importance was judged to be marginal. Finally, in a number of instances the same material may have been published in two or more languages in different periodicals. When such cases were detected, only the version in one of the Western languages has usually been cited.

Organization of bibliographical material. The fundamental principle followed in the organization of this work was to proceed from the most general to the most specific information. There are four main sections. The first, entitled "Balkans," includes works that consider the art and architecture of the Balkan Peninsula in the broadest regional scope. The three following sections, organized alphabetically, are "Albania"; "Bulgaria"; and "Yugoslavia." Within each

### Preface

of these groupings the bibliographical material is further subdivided into narrower categories, the number and nature of which depend entirely on the material itself. Thus under the headings "Balkans" and "Albania" one will find only five subdivisions, whereas under "Bulgaria" and "Yugoslavia" there are eight. While the content of most of these categories and subcategories is evident from their titles, the category entitled "Sites" requires a few words of explanation. In general, the term "site" refers to the name of a place (town, village, isolated monastery, fortress, or archeological site), but it can also refer to other geographic entities (rivers, valleys, mountains, islands, or regions). Because the latter usage is infrequent, when it occurs it is pointed out in the following manner: "Cetina [river]"; "Hvar [island]"; "Fruška Gora [region]."

Throughout, entries are organized alphabetically by authors' names. In the cateogry "Sites" the material is first divided by place names organized alphabetically, and then by authors' names under each place name. In several instances where a large number of entries occurs under a single place name, the material is further divided by individual monuments (e.g., Ohrid--Sv. Bogorodica Bolnička, Sv. Bogorodica Čelnica, etc.), all alphabetized by the name of the monument. Within each monument heading, the standard rule of alphabetical organization by authors' names recurs.

Citations, transliteration rules, place names, and annotations. In citing a work, the name of the author is always listed in the form in which it appears in the original publication. Where different spellings of the last and/or first name occur (e.g., Deroko, Aleksandar as well as Derocco, Alexandre), they are cross-referenced in the author index.

In titles of works, the exact wording and spelling is used with no attempt at correction of grammatical errors. Only an occasional spelling mistake has been corrected, primarily to avoid potential problems with the indexing of names. Where the title of a work is in one of the main Western languages (English, French, German, or Italian), it is cited without translation. Where the title of a work is in a non-Western language but the work includes a summary in one of these four languages, the title of the summary is given; where there is no summary, I have supplied an English translation of the title in brackets.

The user of this bibliography will find that thirteen different languages appear in the citations. Some of these (e.g., Greek, Russian, Serbian, Bulgarian) use alphabets other than Latin. All citations appearing in such languages have been transliterated into the Latin alphabet. The Library of Congress rules on transliteration have been uniformly employed. In cases where a work appeared in transliterated form following rules other than those of the Library of Congress, however, it is cited in its original form.

Names of places are given in their modern form. Where applicable, older names are appended in parentheses following the current form: Durrës (Drač, Durazzo, Durrachion, Durrachium). Cross-references for older names are given in the text as well as in the general index.

The annotations generally consist of two to three sentences describing the essential contribution of the work in question. While on the whole I avoided making critical judgement of individual works, I have attempted to point out major controversial issues on specific subjects.

Indexes. An author index and a general index appear at the end of this volume. The general index lists all personal names (other than those of authors), names of saints, geographic names, names of manuscripts, and iconographic concepts.

Index letter-codes and numbers. For purposes of indexing and cross-referencing, an abbreviation consisting of the first two letters of each main geographic heading is used before the entry numbers: BA for Balkans, AL for Albania, BU for Bulgaria, and YU for Yugoslavia. Within each of these four groupings all entries are numbered consecutively, beginning with "1." There are approximately 32 entries under "Balkans," 96 under "Albania," 488 under "Bulgaria," and 1,318 under "Yugoslavia."

Abbreviations. A list of abbreviations for major periodicals is given alongside the list of periodicals preceding the text.